



**PRIVILEGED & CONFIDENTIAL**

# Memorandum

**Date:** January 27, 2015

**To:** Mr. Michael D'Mello, Registrar of Cemeteries, Ontario Ministry of Consumer Services

**From:** Dr. Robert MacDonald, Assistant Managing Partner

**CC:** Mr. Alan Furbacher, Correct Group of Companies  
Mr. Roman Krupnyk, Barrister & Solicitor  
Ms. Melanie Vincent, Huron-Wendat Nation  
Dr. Louis Lesage, Huron-Wendat Nation  
Mr. Jim Sherratt, Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture & Sport

**Subject:** Summary of Archaeological and Human Burial Assessments, Allandale Station Lands, City of Barrie

---

## Background

The subject property, known as the Allandale Station lands, comprises various parcels especially Part of Lots 8 and 9, Concession 14, (Geographic Township of Innisfil), in the City of Barrie. It is situated north of Gowan Street, south of Tiffin Street/Lakeshore Drive, and east of Essa Road. Kempenfelt Bay of Lake Simcoe is approximately 50 metres to the north. The property area is approximately 4.7 hectares.

In 1907, archaeologist and historian Andrew F. Hunter documented the discovery of a major Huron-Wendat ossuary and associated burials somewhere on the property<sup>1</sup>:

On the Innisfil side of the town line, near the shore of Kempenfeldt Bay, and also near the camps described by Mr. Boon, there was discovered a large ossuary in the year 1846. Mr. Boon owned the land on which it was situated, at the time of this discovery. The diameter of the pit was 20 feet, according to Mr. Boon, or it had a total sinkage of that amount, and it contained many skeletons. . . .(From 200 to 300 would doubtless be near the truth.) Many of the skulls had the round, symmetrical form so common the Huron tribes. Some of the thigh bones were massive. No relics, except bones, were in the pit. Round about, crowed into holes, were some single skeletons; and there were also a few ossuaries of the smaller kind, at least two being verified by the evidence I have been able to gather. The rediscovery of human bones in 1884, and again in 1889, probably belonged to the deposits in the smaller ossuaries.

---

<sup>1</sup> Hunter, A.F. (1907) Huron Village Sites; Being an Appendix to the Report of the Minister of Education for the Year 1906. Toronto: L.K. Cameron.

In 1853, the Grand Trunk Railway constructed the first of a series of stations and associated buildings on the property. A newspaper report, published in the *Barrie Examiner* in 1926, quotes a long-time resident as saying that the ossuary had been situated under where the railway station passenger platform then stood.<sup>2</sup>

### Archaeological and Human Burial Investigations

In 1996, Malcolm Horne, Heritage Planner with the Ontario Ministry of Citizenship, Culture and Recreation (now the Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport (MTCS)) issued a letter to the Clerk of the City of Barrie recommending “a program of monitoring by a licensed archaeological consultant of any subsurface disturbances associated with the redevelopment of this site.” This was followed by a series of archaeological investigations (see Table 1) that led to the discovery and mitigation of parts of the Allandale site (BcGw-69), a significant ancestral Huron-Wendat occupation site dating to the Middle Iroquoian (Uren) period (ca. A.D. 1300-1350). These investigations yielded a series of recommendations for further investigation of the property.

Accidental discovery of human remains in a crawlspace under an extant railway station building in 2011 led to further investigation of this location and others adjacent to the buildings under the authority of the Registrar of Cemeteries (see Table 1). Numerous localities yielding disturbed human bone were identified and recommendations made for further investigation and recovery of human remains.

Table 1: Summary of Archaeological Investigations

Consultant	Archaeological Assessment	Summary	Conclusions & Recommendations
AFBY Archaeological and Heritage Consultants  Licensee: Charlton Carscallen	Archaeological Literature Review and Assessment Recommendations Regarding Allandale Railway Station Site.  27 November, 2000  Client: Skelton Brumwell & Associates	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Andrew Hunter (1907) reported on 1846 <b>discovery of large (ca. 20 ft dia.) ossuary with associated smaller ossuaries and isolated burials</b>; also human remains encountered again in 1884, 1889; descriptions of hundreds of bodies and characteristics of the bones indicate that some excavation was carried out</li> <li>• original train station constructed in 1853</li> <li>• Joseph Rogers, in <i>Barrie Examiner</i> (1926), refers to site as <b>significant Indian burial ground in the vicinity of Allandale Station railway platform</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• subject property exhibits high potential for presence of significant archaeological resources</li> <li>• overlying fill should be removed to allow shovel test pit survey of underlying soils</li> <li>• any construction activities involving alteration of soil or fill beyond assessed area(s) should be monitored by a licensed archaeologist</li> <li>• discovery of archaeological or human remains would require standard protocols for notification of authorities and further assessment</li> </ul>
AFBY Archaeological and Heritage	Stage 3* Archaeological Assessment of the Allandale Site, (BcGw-69): New VR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• indicates that fill overburden ranges from 50 – 200 cm due to original grade of land plus over a century of</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Stage 4 mitigation through salvage excavation by hand of the Allandale site (BcGw-69)</li> </ul>

<sup>2</sup> AFBY Archaeological and Heritage Consultants. (2000). Archaeological Literature Review and Assessment Recommendations Regarding Allandale Railway Station Site. Unpublished report submitted to the Ontario Ministry of Citizenship, Culture and Recreation.

Memo to: Mr. Michael D'Mello, Registrar of Cemeteries  
 Summary of Archaeological and Human Burial Assessments, Allandale Station Lands, City of Barrie

<p>Consultants</p> <p>Licensee: Charlton Carscallen</p> <p>CIF 2001-057-001</p>	<p>Broadcast Centre, Allandale Train Station, Part of Lots 7-10, Innisfil Township, City of Barrie.</p> <p>(* - includes Stages 2 shovel testing)</p> <p>3 June, 2001</p> <p>Client: Skelton Brumwell &amp; Associates</p>	<p>development activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lake Simcoe waterfront was originally immediately in front of station</li> <li>• Stage 2 testpit survey at 3-5 metre intervals was conducted after removal of fill in an area south of the extant station buildings only; units were excavated to sterile subsoil and screened through 5 mm mesh; large quantities of Iroquoian ceramics and fish bone were encountered in several test pits and a large feature that had been impacted by the original station foundation</li> <li>• Stage 3 assessment consisted of 18 one-metre test units excavated over positive test pits; 1,283 artifacts were recovered, including 854 ceramic sherds (dated ca. AD 1300) and 315 faunal bones, mostly fish; 9 subsurface features were identified within 5 of the test units; one small row of post moulds was noted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• monitoring by a licensed archaeologist of fill removal in remaining areas affected by development activities, given potential for discovery of an ossuary</li> </ul>
<p>AFBY Archaeological and Heritage Consultants</p> <p>Licensee: Charlton Carscallen</p> <p>CIF# 2001-057-004</p>	<p>Stage 4 Archaeological Mitigation of the Allandale Site (BcGw-69), Lots 7-10, Concession 14 (Formerly Innisfil Twp.) City of Barrie.</p> <p>September 2001</p> <p>Client: The New VR</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• documents a series of construction phases on the property, beginning in 1853, including 4 station houses plus associated buildings</li> <li>• damage during thunderstorm flood event in 1896 led to construction of current station, completed in 1905</li> <li>• at least 10 structures and five major track lines on property by 1920s</li> <li>• bore hole studies show up to 5 m of fill on property</li> <li>• Gradall and hand excavation used to remove fill overburden in areas of Stage 3 artifact discoveries</li> <li>• 59 Stage 4 units were excavated and screened, totaling 76 square metres</li> <li>• <b>16,700 artifacts, including &gt;10,000 faunal elements (none identified as human bone), were recovered</b></li> <li>• one intact subsurface feature, a slope midden, was encountered as well as several post moulds</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• although archaeological integrity of site is described as poor, potential artifact and information yield is described as high</li> <li>• although deemed to be unlikely, the <b>potential persists for the discovery of human remains in deeply buried deposits</b></li> <li>• heritage value is deemed to be high</li> <li>• portion of the site comprising 1863 stone foundation should be cleared of further heritage concerns</li> <li>• <b>archaeological monitoring to be carried out during fill removal on remainder of property due to possibility of encountering ossuaries or human burials</b></li> <li>• area of the Barrie Lawn Bowling Club should be subjected to archaeological testing/monitoring</li> <li>• area of site subjected to Stages 3 and 4 excavation should be cleared of further archaeological concern</li> </ul>
<p>New Directions Archaeology Ltd.</p> <p>Licensee: Philip Woodley</p> <p>PIF# P018-058-2004</p>	<p>Stage 1 Archaeological Assessment of Five Areas for the Go Rail Service Expansion – Bradford To Barrie Study Area, City Of Barrie</p> <p>December 2004</p> <p>Client: McCormick Rankin Corporation</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• assesses archaeological potential of 5 candidate GO railway station and layover sites in the City of Barrie, including part of the Allandale Station lands</li> <li>• query of the Ontario Archaeological Sites Database, maintained by the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, yielded no record of archaeological sites within the subject property or on the immediately adjacent property (i.e. the Allandale Site</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Stage 2 assessment was recommended for 2 of the 5 sites</li> <li>• <b>no further work was recommended for 3 of the 5 sites, including the site which comprised part of the Allandale Station lands</b></li> <li>• <b>the Ontario Ministry of Culture issued a letter of concurrence for this report on 22 February,</b></li> </ul>

Memo to: Mr. Michael D’Mello, Registrar of Cemeteries  
 Summary of Archaeological and Human Burial Assessments, Allandale Station Lands, City of Barrie

		<p>(BcGw-69)), although numerous Iroquoian and other sites were noted within 2 kilometres</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• apparently the Allandale Site (BcGw-69) had not yet been registered or entered into the provincial database by this date, although it had been investigated 3 years prior to this report</li> <li>• the report makes no reference to the previous work by AFBY Archaeological and Heritage Consultants on the adjacent portion of the Allandale Station lands, nor would the consultant have had any straightforward way to learn of that work</li> <li>• visual inspection determined that 3 of the 5 sites were completely disturbed and thus retained no further archaeological potential</li> </ul>	<p><b>2007</b></p>
<p>AMICK Consultants Limited</p> <p>Licensee: Michael Henry</p> <p>PIF# P058-580-2009</p>	<p>Stage 1 Archaeological Background Research of the Allandale Station Lands, Part of Lot 8 &amp; 9, Concession 14 (Geographic Township of Innisfil), City of Barrie.</p> <p>03 March, 2010</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• reviews AFBY report</li> <li>• provides overlays of buildings indicated on various historical maps and plans</li> <li>• provides thorough analysis of archaeological potential</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• re-iterated AFBY recommendations</li> <li>• quotes from MTCR (Malcolm Horne) letter of 04OCT01 concurring with AFBY recommendations (see above)</li> <li>• <b>lands not previously assessed and cleared (by AFBY) retain archaeological potential and should not be subject to grade altering activities until further Stage 2 assessment and clearance of archaeological concerns by MTCS</b></li> <li>• <b>fill-capped areas must be assessed by Gradall (or equivalent) stripping at no more than 10 m intervals</b></li> <li>• areas with residual archaeological deposits will require Stage 3 assessment and possibly Stage 4 mitigation</li> <li>• <b>comprehensive stripping of native topsoil will be required to ensure there are no undiscovered human burials</b></li> <li>• modifications to the extant structures requiring below-grade alterations should be subject to pre-clearance by an archaeologist</li> </ul>
<p>AMICK Consultants Limited</p> <p>Licensee: Michael Henry</p> <p>P058-767-2011</p>	<p>Stage 3 Archaeological Site Assessment of Human Remains within the Crawl Space of the “Office Building” at the Allandale Train Station, Barrie, Ontario.</p> <p>27 August, 2011</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• describes results of investigation of discovery of human remains carried out under the authority of the Registrar of Cemeteries</li> <li>• <b>remains of at least two individuals were found</b> damaged and in secondary deposits</li> <li>• no associated archaeological materials or features were encountered</li> <li>• discovery of a shovel-shaped incisor suggests probable First Nations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• although the known human remains were recovered from crawl space, “the disturbed soil in this area may yet contain further concentrations of human remains or isolated bones or bone fragments.”</li> <li>• <b>recommends that investigation “be continued until all re-grading of soil in the crawl space has been completed and</b></li> </ul>

		association	the area is capped with concrete.”
AMICK Consultants Limited  Licensee: Michael Henry  P058-901-2012	Stage 3 Archaeological Site-specific Assessment of the Allandale Site (BcGw-69), City of Barrie, Ontario.  07 November, 2013	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>describes results of investigation of discovery of human remains carried out under the authority of the Registrar of Cemeteries</li> <li>additional remains found along south side of “Office Building” foundation (outside of crawl space where previous discovery occurred) as well as on the SW side of the colonnaded walkway</li> <li>includes monitoring of various utility trenches</li> <li>methodology devised in consultation with City of Barrie project engineers, Jim Sherratt, MTCS, and Michael D’Mello, Registrar of Cemeteries</li> <li><b>653 bones identified as human were recovered from 18 localities adjacent to extant buildings</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>“No further investigations are recommended for the crawl space of the “Office Building”, nor for the outside area of the foundation opposite the locus of discovery in the crawl space.”</li> <li><b>“ . . . it is recommended that the area of previous archaeological investigations [by AFBY] be excavated mechanically and all dirt be screened through a 6 mm sieve to recover the bone fragments from this area.</b></li> <li><b>additional block excavation north of the covered walkway to establish limits and nature of human bone concentrations in this area</b></li> <li><b>All unassessed portions of property, including under buildings without full basements and areas capped by asphalt or concrete pavement, should be excavated and monitored under the supervision of a licensed bioarchaeologist</b></li> </ul>

### Summary

Significant archaeological deposits and evidence of pre-contact human interments, most likely affiliated with the ancestral Huron-Wendat population of historic Wendake, have been encountered and documented since 1846 on the property now known as the Allandale Station lands in the City of Barrie. Archaeological investigations carried out since 2000 have provided greater detail on the nature and extent of these archaeological deposits, including those containing human remains. These investigations have been carried out under license from the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport (MTCS), and since 2011 have been conducted under direction from the Registrar of Cemeteries, Ontario Ministry of Consumer Services (MCS). All but one of these investigations have yielded recommendations for further, detailed, archaeological assessment, recovery of human remains, and mitigation of archaeological deposits.

### Conclusions and Recommendations

Redevelopment of the Allandale Station lands in the City of Barrie has been under the scrutiny of provincial government officials since 1996. Initial concerns were expressed by the Ontario Ministry of Citizenship, Culture and Recreation (now MTCS) in their role as stewards of provincial interest with respect to archaeology. When human remains were discovered on the property in 2011, the Registrar of Cemeteries with the Cemeteries Regulation Unit, MCS, also became involved. While archaeological investigations completed by AFBY Archaeological and Heritage Consultants in 2000

January 27, 2015

Memo to: Mr. Michael D'Mello, Registrar of Cemeteries  
Summary of Archaeological and Human Burial Assessments, Allandale Station Lands, City of Barrie

---

and 2001, on behalf of Skelton Brumwell Associates Inc. (planners & engineers) and The New VR (CKVR Television), would not comply with current MTCS *Standards and Guidelines for Consultant Archaeologists* (2011), we concur with the recommendations which stipulate the need for further investigations to identify and mitigate additional archaeological resources in unassessed areas of the property and to ensure that there were no unidentified human burials extant. MTCS has also concurred with these recommendations in a letter dated 04 October, 2001.

The Stage 1 archaeological investigation of five candidate GO railway station and layover sites—one of which includes a portion of the Allandale Station lands—completed by New Directions Archaeology Ltd. in 2004, also would not comply with current MTCS *Standards and Guidelines for Consultant Archaeologists* (2011). Unfortunately, due to systemic gaps in the registration of newly discovered archaeological sites and the tracking of archaeological assessments, the consultant was not aware of the previous work carried out on the Allandale Station lands by AFBY, nor of the fact that they had documented the possible existence of an ossuary and associated burials on the property and had investigated and carried out a Stage 4 salvage excavation of the Allandale Site (BcGw-69). Further systemic gaps are indicated by the fact that in 2007 the Ministry of Culture issued a concurrence letter for this report—essentially clearing the candidate GO station site on the Allandale Station lands of any further provincial archaeological concern—in spite of the outstanding recommendations for further work on the property to which they had previously agreed in 2001.

A Stage 1 archaeological investigation, completed by AMICK Consultants Limited in 2010 on behalf of the City of Barrie, was carried out in accordance with 2009 draft MTCS *Standards and Guidelines for Consultant Archaeologists*. Although it makes no reference to the Stage 1 assessment carried out by New Directions Archaeology Ltd., this report does reiterate the previous recommendations of AFBY for further assessment and added the recommendation that comprehensive stripping of native topsoil across the virtually the entire property would be required to ensure there are no undiscovered human burials. We concur with these recommendations. Two consecutive Stage 3 assessments completed by AMICK in 2011 and 2013 on behalf of the City of Barrie, were carried out in accordance with 2011 MTCS *Standards and Guidelines for Consultant Archaeologists* and are currently under review by MTCS. These were initiated at the request of the MCS Registrar of Cemeteries to determine the nature and extent of scattered human bone accidentally discovered during re-development of the railway station buildings. These reports indicate that the remains are likely associated with the Late Iroquoian period (i.e. ancestral Huron-Wendat) Allandale site (BcGw-69) documented by AFBY and recommend the following: further investigation of soil containing human remains in secondary deposits; screening of backdirt from the AFBY investigation to recover human bone; block excavation and screening of soil in the vicinity of the railway station buildings where human bone had been recovered; and investigation of all unassessed portions of property, including under buildings without full basements and areas capped by asphalt or concrete pavement, under the supervision of a licensed bio-archaeologist. We concur with these recommendations.

To summarize, the archaeological work carried out on the property since 2000 seems to have been generally consistent with prevailing standards and guidelines at the time the work was carried out, and the recommendations arising therefrom are consistent with best practices. We are also confident that, had New Directions Archaeology Ltd. been aware of the previously documented

January 27, 2015

Memo to: Mr. Michael D'Mello, Registrar of Cemeteries  
Summary of Archaeological and Human Burial Assessments, Allandale Station Lands, City of Barrie

---

ossuary and Allandale site (BcGw-69) investigations on the portion of the Allandale Station lands adjacent to their study area, they would have recommended Stage 2 assessment of the candidate GO station site.

We are therefore very concerned that gaps in provincially mandated policies and protocols, such as those which led to the construction of the Allandale GO Station without a Stage 2 archaeological assessment, may result in further construction impacts to archaeological deposits and/or human remains on the Allandale Station lands. We recommend that urgent action be taken by all concerned to ensure that any future development activities with potential for sub-surface impacts be preceded by careful Stage 2 *et al.* archaeological investigations that address all provincial interests in archaeological heritage and human remains to the satisfaction of MTCS and MCS. We also recommend that, henceforth, the authorized representatives of the Huron-Wendat Nation, copied herewith, be engaged in a process of consultation and accommodation concerning disposition of human remains recovered to date, further archaeological assessments or mitigations, or activities related to the investigation or recovery of human remains.

Sincerely,

**ARCHAEOLOGICAL SERVICES INC.**



Robert I. MacDonald, PhD, RPA  
Assistant Managing Partner